### MINUTES OF THE SCHOOL BOARD AUDIT AND BUDGET ADVISORY COMMITTEE OF MIAMI-DADE COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS March 10, 2015

The School Board Audit and Budget Advisory Committee (ABAC) met on Tuesday, March 10, 2015, in the School Board Administration Building, Conference Room 916, at 1450 N.E. Second Avenue, Miami, Florida.

### Members Present:

### Voting:

Mr. Roland Sanchez-Medina, Jr., Esq., Chair Mr. Nestor Caballero, CPA MST CGAP Mr. Juan del Busto Ms. Marian L. Hasty, Esq. Ms. Susan Marie Kairalla Mr. Christopher Norwood, J.D. Ms. Raquel Regalado, School Board Member Mr. David Schwartz Mr. Erick Wendelken, CPA

### Members Absent:

Mr. Rayfield McGhee, Jr., Esq., Vice Chair Dr. Lawrence S. Feldman, School Board Vice Chair Mr. Joseph Gebara, PTSA/PTA President Mr. Isaac Salver, CPA

### Non-Voting:

Mrs. Judith M. Marte, Chief Financial Officer

### Call to Order

The ABAC's Chair Mr. Roland Sanchez-Medina called the meeting to order at 12:31 p.m. and warmly welcomed everyone in attendance.

### 1. Welcome, Introductions and Moment of Reflection

The Chair requested all in attendance to introduce themselves, which they did. The following persons were present:

Ms. Perla Tabares Hantman, School Board Chair
Dr. Marta Pérez, School Board Member
Mr. Alberto M. Carvalho, Superintendent of Schools
Mr. Walter J. Harvey, School Board Attorney
Mr. Jose Dotres, Chief of Staff
Mrs. Valtena G. Brown, Dep. Supt./Chief Oper. Officer
Ms. Daisy Gonzalez-Diego, Chief Communications Offr.
Mr. José F. Montes de Oca, Chief Auditor
Mr. Kimrey Newlin, Alternate ABAC Member
Ms. Enid Weisman, Chief Human Capital Officer
Ms. Maria L. Izquierdo, Chief Academic Officer

Mr. Jaime G. Torrens, Chief Facilities Officer Ms. Deborah Karcher, Chief Information Officer Mr. Edward McAuliff, Chief Information Security Ofcr. Ms. Melody Thelwell, Chief Procurement Officer Mr. Luis Garcia, Deputy School Board Attorney Ms. Mindy McNichols, Asst. School Board Attorney Mr. Steffond L. Cone, Assistant Superintendent Dr. Magaly C. Abrahante, Assistant Superintendent Dr. Sylvia J. Diaz, Assistant Superintendent Ms. Tiffanie Pauline, Assistant Superintendent Dr. Ana M. Rasco, Assistant Superintendent

Ms. Connie Pou, Controller Ms. Maria T. Gonzalez, Asst. Chief, School Audits Mr. Julio Miranda, Asst. Chief, Investigations Mr. Trevor L. Williams, Asst. Chief, District Audits Mr. Leonardo Fernandez, Treasurer Ms. Barbara A. Mendizabal, Region Superintendent Dr. Albert Payne, Jr., Region Superintendent Ms. Vivian M. Santiesteban-Pardo, Region Supt. Ms. Joyce Castro, Administrative Director Ms. Tabitha Fazzino. Administrative Director Ms. Daisy Naya, Assistant Controller Mr. Ron Y. Steiger, Chief Budget Officer Ms. Cynthia Gracia, Administrative Director Ms. Penny Parham, Administrative Director Mr. Eric Ojeda, District Director Mr. Jon Goodman, Executive Audit Director Ms. Beatriz Pereira. Executive Director Ms. Tamara Wain. Director Mr. Christopher Morgan, Director Mr. Luis Baluja, Supervisor Ms. Maria Curbelo, Audit Coordinator Ms. Elvira Sanchez, Audit Supervisor I Mr. David Coleman, Chief of Staff Ms. Jackeline Fals, Chief of Staff Ms. Ana Lara, Administrative Assistant

Ms. Marisol Marin. Administrative Assistant Ms. Maloy C. Morales, Administrative Assistant Ms. Carman Naumann, Administrative Assistant Ms. Maria Teresa Rojas, Administrative Assistant Ms. Dalia Rosales, Administrative Assistant Ms. Maria E. Delgado, Secretary Ms. Elsa Berrios-Montijo. Staff Assistant Ms. Lucila I. Gonzalez. Administrative Secretary Mr. Felix Jimenez, Assistant Inspector General Mr. Thomas Knigge, OIG, Supervisor Special Agent Ms. Patra Liu, OIG, General Counsel Mr. Fernando Zulueta, President, Academica Ms. Christina Perdomo-Fernandez, Academica Mr. Carlos Ferralls, Vice President, Doral Academy Mr. Jose Iglesias, Auditor, Doral Academy Mr. Regino Rodriguez, Auditor, Doral Academy Mr. Rvan Kairalla, Doral College Mr. Robert Alfaro, VAB Manager Mr. Mark Martinez, Senior Deputy, Clerk of Clerks Ms. Sheila Salters, Miami-Dade County Mr. Orlando Alonso, Administrator Director, DOT Mr. Lazaro Solis, Deputy Property Appraiser Mr. Donnovan Maginley, Partner, McGladrey LLP Mr. Roberto Valdes, Citizen

The Committee members warmly welcomed the newest members of the ABAC, Mr. Erick Wendelken, CPA, Morrison, Brown, Argiz & Farra, LLC, Mr. Juan del Busto, Chairman and CEO of Del Busto Capital Partners, Inc. and Mr. Kimrey Newlin (ABAC Alternate), TD Bank.

On behalf of Dr. Feldman, the Committee recognized Dr. Richard H. Hinds, retired Chief Financial Officer, for his outstanding years of service to Miami-Dade County Public Schools and valuable contributions to the ABAC. A plaque was presented in his honor; however, he was unable to receive it since he could not attend the meeting. This meritorious award will be delivered to Dr. Hinds.

### 2. Approval of the Minutes of the School Board Audit and Budget Advisory Committee Meeting of January 27, 2015

The Chair drew the members' attention to the minutes for the ABAC meeting of January 27, 2015, and asked whether any members had any suggested revisions or questions related to the contents of the proposed minutes.

Ms. Kairalla moved and Ms. Regalado seconded the approval of the minutes, as presented, to serve as the memorialization of the January 27, 2015, ABAC meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

### **INTERNAL AUDITS:**

### 3. Audit of Miami-Dade County Value Adjustment Board (VAB) Appeals Process

The Chief Auditor introduced the above-referenced report and pointed out that the audit was requested by the Superintendent; recommended to be performed by this Committee; approved by the School Board and agreed upon by the Value Adjustment Board (VAB). He explained that since the VAB operations are intertwined with the Property Appraiser's Office (PAO) operations, it became apparent that there is a need to audit both operations in order to provide a comprehensive analysis. He stated that due to time constraints and the resources available to finish the VAB audit for this meeting as promised, he bifurcated the audit assignment into two phases, the first addressing the VAB, which is presented today, and the second addressing the PAO, which is scheduled to be presented at the ABAC meeting of May or early July 2015. He provided a brief overview of the contents of the report noting that it contains nine findings and eleven recommendations and offered to answer any questions.

The Chair circulated a memorandum from Dr. Feldman, who was not able to attend the meeting, outlining his recommendations pertaining to the VAB audit report. The Chief Auditor pointed out that he received Dr. Feldman's memorandum immediately preceding the Committee meeting.

Ms. Regalado added on the contents of Dr. Feldman's memorandum and indicated that the memorandum addresses several points that were previously acted upon by the School Board.

The Chair noted that this Committee has also expressed similar concerns on this issue.

Ms. Regalado provided a status report of her current involvement with the VAB and stated that the VAB had a very productive special meeting where its members spoke about some of the issues related to the audit report. She announced that another VAB meeting is forthcoming. Ms. Regalado thanked the School Board staff and the Chief Auditor for attending the last VAB meeting and observed that there is representation from the VAB in attendance at the meeting, ready to respond to the substance of the recommendations in the VAB audit report. The Chair recognized that Ms. Regalado is the School Board's appointed representative to the VAB.

Mr. Mark Martinez, Senior Deputy, Clerk of Courts, speaking on behalf of the VAB, pointed out that they reviewed the audit and stated that the administration will follow directions from the VAB to implement the recommendations contained in the report.

Mr. Norwood asked the Chief Auditor to elaborate on the language on page 37 of the report that the OMCA cannot audit the VAB. The Chief Auditor responded that although he does not have the express authority to audit the VAB's operations, he was able to conduct the audit because the VAB consented. He explained that since the School Board provides substantial resources to the VAB, he recommends that the School Board be given the authority to audit the VAB. Mr. Norwood asked if it was the decision of the VAB to allow his office to audit. The Chief Auditor replied that the VAB is governed by the Florida Statutes

and the Department of Revenue (DOR) Rules and has allowed his office representing the School Board to perform the VAB audit.

Mr. Robert Alfaro, VAB Manager, responded that the most recent audit was performed by the County's Audit and Management Services and another was conducted by the Auditor General approximately two years ago. Mr. Norwood asked the Chief Auditor if his audit is different from the one mentioned by Mr. Alfaro. The Chief Auditor replied that the scope of his audit is different and although it is not required, the School Board should be afforded the opportunity to audit the VAB, as the School Board provides substantial resources to operate the VAB (40%). Mr. Norwood endorsed Dr. Feldman's recommendations on the memorandum and suggested that it be considered as an action item.

The Chair noted that since Dr. Feldman's memorandum was just received, it could not be fully assimilated by the ABAC; therefore, it is not fair to Dr. Feldman or the Committee to consider it as such.

Mr. Harvey indicated that under Florida Statutes, 40% of the VAB's revenue is provided by the School District, which should give the District the authority to audit the VAB, whenever it is considered necessary.

Ms. Regalado noted that several of the recommendations contained in Dr. Feldman's memorandum were already acted upon by the School Board and added that a contractual relationship is the best way to address these issues.

Ms. Regalado asked the School Board Attorney for the status of the contract between the School Board and other entities contained in an agenda item previously approved by the School Board. Mr. Harvey stated that he sent the recommendations to the VAB, Clerk of Courts, PAO and the Miami-Dade County Mayor requesting to enter into an interlocal agreement. He indicated that bi-weekly meetings are taking place with the entities in order to work on these issues and have a signed agreement in the near future.

Mr. Carvalho mentioned that Dr. Feldman's memorandum reflects all the requested actions that the School Board unanimously approved. He expressed frustration with the fact that even if all the recommendations contained in the audit report are implemented and a contractual agreement with the County, which validate the contentions of the administration, is entered into and implemented the District will still endure a \$30 to \$50 million shortfall this year. He stated that the findings noted in the audit report are egregious, which vindicate and substantiate the concerns expressed by his administration over the past several years. He stated for the record that not everything is fine just because there is an audit report which validates the concerns of the administration, when the reality is that funds needed by the District are being left somewhere. He thanked the Chief Auditor, Ms. Regalado, VAB Representatives and the ABAC for endorsing the recommendations of this audit.

Mr. del Busto expressed disbelief that this situation has been taking place for over two years and inquired as to who is responsible for fixing this situation. The Superintendent noted that he has been asking the same questions and all he has heard is who is not responsible, but he believes it is the "County's responsibility", wherever it lands. Ms. Regalado announced that at the next VAB meeting they will be asking for implementation of the recommendations in the audit report, although she recognized that some of the recommendations are out of the jurisdiction of the VAB. She stated that even if the County is not sure of who is responsible because the PAO is an independent office, the fact remains that ultimately it reports to the Mayor.

In response to a question regarding if tax payers are required to pay 75% of property taxes assessed, the Chief Auditor indicated that when a taxpayer appeals, he/she is required to pay at least 75% of the taxes being accessed. He explained that two years ago, when taxpayers appealed, they were not required to pay anything and that in an effort to remedy this situation, legislation was passed requiring payment of at least 75%. Mr. Montes de Oca further explained that if the property tax payer pays 100% of the assessment and the eventual assessment is reduced by more than he/she paid, then the taxpayer is entitled to 1% a month (12% per year) interest on the amount overpaid.

In response to another question regarding whether taxpayers must pay 12% interest if they underpay, the Chief Auditor responded that there is a statutory requirement for them to pay interest at the same 12% rate.

Mr. Norwood asked for an explanation on Finding #6 (A small number of unlicensed agents were non-qualified with taxpayer authorization requirements). Mr. Trevor L. Williams, Assistant Chief Auditor, explained that according to Florida Statutes and DOR Rules, registered agents are not required to obtain the signature from the taxpayer they represent; however, non-registered agents must obtain authorization from the taxpayer authorizing them to bring the cases before the VAB. Mr. Norwood then asked a series of questions regarding the audit findings that were addressed by the auditors and the representatives from the VAB.

Mr. Caballero noted that some of the recommendations in the audit are remedied by two legislative bills and asked if this is going to solve these issues. The Superintendent responded that if the legislation, as written, passes it will provide relief to the VAB issues. He hopes that once the bills become law, there will be a follow-up with the rules and process by the County to ensure compliance.

Ms. Hantman expressed a concern regarding the monies owed to the District, regardless of whether the School Board is successful at the State level in resolving the VAB issues, and asked Ms. Regalado about status of the monies owed to the District and who is responsible. Ms. Regalado stated that there is no answer to her question at the moment, but indicated that at the VAB meeting the Board unanimously expressed the desire to change some of the VAB procedures to help the District. She explained that the VAB issue is unique to Miami-Dade County and it is very difficult for the VAB issue to become the priority of the legislation when VABs at other counties are working very well. Ms. Regalado mentioned that there will be an upcoming VAB meeting to explore the implementation of the recommendations in the audit report and also to figure out the necessary changes pertaining to the VAB interaction with the PAO.

Ms. Hantman expressed her frustration of not knowing who is responsible for the VAB and PAO situation.

#### Minutes of the School Board Audit and Budget Advisory Committee March 10, 2015 Page 6 of 10

Dr. Pérez and members of the Committee thanked the Chief Auditor and his staff for a very well done audit report.

There were no further comments. A motion was made by Ms. Kairalla, seconded by Mr. Wendelken, which carried unanimously, to recommend that the <u>Audit of Miami-Dade</u> <u>County Value Adjustment Board (VAB) Appeals Process</u> be received and filed by the School Board.

### EXTERNAL AUDITS:

### 4. Internal Audit Report – Selected Schools/Centers

Mr. Montes de Oca introduced the above-referenced report and yielded the floor to Ms. Maria T. Gonzalez, Assistant Chief Auditor, for the presentation. Ms. Gonzalez presented the audit results of 37 schools/centers for one or two year audit periods. She observed that out of the 37 schools, eight had audit exceptions that included deficiencies in internal funds, FTE, management of school property and the monitoring of school-site data security. She also highlighted the audit of Sweetwater Elementary which addressed a complaint referred to the audit department by School Operations, regarding concerns expressed by a private citizen whose spouse had worked at that school. Ms. Gonzalez briefly discussed the allegations and pointed out that the report substantiated three of the six allegations made by the complainant.

The complainant, Mr. Roberto Valdes, expressed a high degree of dissatisfaction with the results of the Sweetwater Elementary audit report and made some irreverent comments about the report. He explained the allegations, noting that they were the reason the audit was conducted.

The Chief Auditor responded that he has been an auditor for more than 34 years and has been involved in more than 9,000 school audits without any of them being questioned. Mr. Montes de Oca stated that he interviewed the complainant regarding his allegations and some of the allegations were substantiated, while others were not. He noted when allegations are made there are sometimes unintended consequence such as the ones referenced in the audit report. Mr. Montes de Oca pointed out for the record that he is independent from the administration; he does not engage in a public debate; he stands by his audit report; and does not appreciate the references made by the complainant about the audit report.

Mr. Jose Dotres, Chief of Staff, also added for the record that he takes allegations very seriously and that the administration has been very deliberate in meeting with Mr. Valdes and acknowledging the allegations. He explained that the Superintendent directed the administration to systemically communicate with the schools on how to follow proper procedures in regards to paraprofessionals/security monitors. He stated that Title I manuals have been enhanced; very precise wording has been added so that procedures are followed and processes are in place in order to ensure that the schools utilize personnel appropriately.

Dr. Magaly Abrahante, Assistant Superintendent, emphasized that she also met with the complainant and his wife and based on the results of the meeting, her office conducted an

informal review of their allegations and made the recommendation to School Operations to request an audit at the school in question. Dr. Abrahante noted that they did a thorough review of all the Title I programs at over 300 schools and she believes this to be an isolated incident.

In response to Mr. Valdes' question regarding what is going to happen to the school administrator responsible for the substantiated allegations, the Superintendent responded that he does not flog employees at public meetings and that there will be an opportunity after the audit report goes to the School Board for the District administration to make a decision. He stated that Mr. Valdes approached him several times about this matter and he repeatedly told him that he does not interfere with ongoing investigations.

There was some discussion pertaining to other schools having recurring findings for the past two years under the same administrators. Ms. Valtena Brown, Deputy Superintendent/Chief Operating Officer, explained that administrative procedures are implemented when they review audits.

Addressing a comment made, the Chair noted that the administration is ultimately responsible for making decisions on what to do with the employees.

Dr. Pérez asked for an update regarding what to do with the Title I fund finding. Ms. Gonzalez provided a brief overview of the finding and pointed out that the recommendation on the report regarding Title I funds is to self-report the instance of non-compliance with Title I policy to the Florida Department of Education, as provided under Title I administration guidelines. She gave a brief overview of the finding regarding additional responsibilities of a paraprofessional who is paid from Title I funds.

The Superintendent explained that a paraprofessional responsibility is to provide educational services and when there is an expenditure charged to a grant which is not allowed, it is charged back to the general fund. He emphasized that for two years in row the Single Audit of the District, which covered over \$500 million in expenditures each year, did not have a single finding. Referring to the investigation at Sweetwater Elementary, he stated that the District administration continues to monitor this issue and pointed out that he agrees with the findings and recommendations in the audit report.

There were no further comments. A motion was made by Ms. Regalado, seconded by Mr. Schwartz, which carried unanimously, to recommend that the <u>Internal audit Report –</u> <u>Selected Schools/Centers</u> be received and filed by the School Board.

# 5. Investigation Conducted Pursuant To A Referral By Florida Department of Education Inspector General

Mr. Montes de Oca introduced the above-reference report and stated that pursuant to the request of the Florida Department of Education Inspector General, an investigation was conducted and found no probable cause.

#### Minutes of the School Board Audit and Budget Advisory Committee March 10, 2015 Page 8 of 10

There were no questions. This report was presented for informational purposes only; therefore, no transmittal to School Board by the ABAC was required.

### 6. Miami-Dade County District School Board's Operational Audit

The Chief Auditor introduced the above-referenced report and stated that it contained some findings and recommendations and that the administration took corrective actions to address the findings.

In response to Mr. Caballero's question regarding clarification on the administration's response to Finding #2 pertaining to a \$959,000 fuel tax refund, Ms. Pou explained that the District spends well in excess of the \$959,000 from its General Fund to repair and maintain schools and has procedures in place to earmark monies from the Capital Funds and use them for future projects to comply with the statutory requirement.

Ms. Hantman inquired about Finding #1 pertaining to the posting of the District's budget on the website. Mrs. Marte responded that the budget has always been posted on the website as required by State Statute and explained that the oversight had to do with posting the proposed July budget, but not the September official budget. She stated that this has been rectified retroactively and that the District is now in full compliance with the requirements. Ms. Hantman indicated that she had not received the Superintendent's memorandum modifying his employment contract regarding his severance pay provisions referenced in Finding #5. The administration responded that they will gladly provide her with said The Superintendent explained that the modification is specific to the memorandum. severance provision on termination without cause. Lastly, Ms. Hantman inquired about Finding #7 regarding the filing of statements of financial interest with the Procurement Department (PD). Mrs. Marte pointed out that the District is in compliance with the annual filing of statements of financial interest. She explained that the audit finding relates to previous years, when a list of everyone who files one of these statements was not provided to the PD for its review to ensure that there are no conflicts of interest with vendors. She emphasized that the problem has been rectified and that this year the list has been reviewed by the PD. Ms. Hantman had concerns that the School Board policy does not require filing of statements of financial interest with the PD. Mrs. Marte concurred with Ms. Hantman's observation and stated that a corresponding revision to the School Board policy will be forthcoming to the School Board for approval.

There were no further questions. A motion was made by Ms. Kairalla, seconded by Mr. del Busto, which carried unanimously, to recommend that the <u>Miami-Dade County District</u> <u>School Board's Operational Audit</u> be received and filed by the School Board.

### **OTHER REPORTS:**

# 7. Presentation for 36 of 126 Charter Schools Audited Financial Statements FYE June 30, 2014

The Chief Auditor presented the above-referenced report and stated that his office is charged with the responsibility of reviewing the charter schools financial statements and bringing any

relevant issues to the attention of the ABAC and the School Board. He noted that 29 of the 36 charter schools had no issues, but expressed concerns about governing board members of some schools who are employees of other charter schools which are also operated by the same management company as the school where they serve as employees. He specifically noted that these board members approve transfers of funds to other entities where they work. He pointed out that these issues were previously brought to the attention of the ABAC and the School Board and he is awaiting a response from the Florida Department of Education (DOE) for clarification on the issue of transferring funds, since the law is silent as to whether or not it is permissible.

In response to Mr. Norwood's request for clarification on the issues related to members of the governing boards, the Chief Auditor explained that there is an issue where some of the members serving different governing boards voted to approve transactions transferring funds and it is his duty to bring this issue to the attention of the ABAC and the School Board.

Addressing more discussion on the issue of governing board members, Ms. McNichols offered to research these inquiries, obtain clarification on the legality of this issue and present her research at the next ABAC meeting. Mr. Norwood requested to also ask the DOE if there is a difference of opinion on this issue.

Ms. Hantman expressed her frustration with having to discuss the same charter school issues at every ABAC meeting and pointed out that an audit had been conducted and presented according to the law.

The Chief Auditor concurred with Ms. Hantman and reiterated that it was his duty to bring these issues to the attention of the ABAC and the School Board and stated that he communicated with the DOE to obtain clarification on the issue of funds transfers in order to resolve this matter once and for all.

After some more discussion, the Chief Auditor offered to further review and research the issue of the governing boards thoroughly with the School Board Attorney's office and provide an update at the next ABAC meeting.

Mr. Douglas Rodriguez, Principal, Doral Academy, Inc., pointed out that the two members mentioned in the audit report are no longer serving on the governing board of the Doral Academy Inc. and Somerset. He stated that the two members have resigned due to the concerns of the District.

Mr. Caballero's recused himself from participating in any discussion pertaining to the ASPIRA Eugenia Maria de Hostos, ASPIRA South Youth Leadership, and ASPIRA Raul Arnaldo Martinez charters schools because his firm is involved in the audits of these schools. Mr. Wendelken recused himself from participating in any discussion pertaining to Somerset Academy South Miami because his son attends this school. A motion was made by Ms. Regalado, seconded by Mr. del Busto, which carried otherwise unanimously, to recommend that the **Presentation for 36 of 126 Charter Schools Audited Financial Statements FYE June 30, 2014** be received and filed by the School Board.

### 8. Monthly Financial Report Unaudited – For The Period Ending December 2014

Mr. Montes de Oca introduced the above-referenced report and welcomed any questions.

There were no questions. This report was presented for informational purposes only; therefore, no transmittal to School Board by the ABAC was required.

### 9. Office of Management and Compliance Audits' Activity Report

Mr. Montes de Oca introduced the above-referenced report and welcomed any questions.

There were no questions. This report was presented for informational purposes only; therefore, no transmittal to School Board by the ABAC was required.

### New Business:

None.

### Old Business:

None.

### Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Committee and upon motion duly made and seconded, the meeting was adjourned by Mr. Roland Sanchez-Medina at 2:10 p.m.

/lig

## FORM 8B MEMORANDUM OF VOTING CONFLICT FOR COUNTY, MUNICIPAL, AND OTHER LOCAL PUBLIC OFFICERS

LAST NAME-FIRST NAME-MIDDLE NAME		NAME OF BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY, OR COMMITTEE	
Caballero, Nestor		School Board Audit and Budget Advisory Committee (ABAC)	
MAILING ADDRESS 4649 Ponce de Leon Blvd. Suite #404		THE BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY OR COMMITTEE ON WHICH I SERVE IS A UNIT OF:	
CITY Coral Gables	COUNTY Miami-Dade	NAME OF POLITICAL SUBDIVISION:	
DATE ON WHICH VOTE OCCURRED		MY POSITION IS:	
3/10/15			

### WHO MUST FILE FORM 8B

This form is for use by any person serving at the county, city, or other local level of government on an appointed or elected board, council, commission, authority, or committee. It applies equally to members of advisory and non-advisory bodies who are presented with a voting conflict of interest under Section 112.3143, Florida Statutes.

Your responsibilities under the law when faced with voting on a measure in which you have a conflict of interest will vary greatly depending on whether you hold an elective or appointive position. For this reason, please pay close attention to the instructions on this form before completing the reverse side and filing the form.

### INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 112.3143, FLORIDA STATUTES

A person holding elective or appointive county, municipal, or other local public office MUST ABSTAIN from voting on a measure which inures to his or her special private gain or loss. Each elected or appointed local officer also is prohibited from knowingly voting on a measure which inures to the special gain or loss of a principal (other than a government agency) by whom he or she is retained (including the parent organization or subsidiary of a corporate principal by which he or she is retained); to the special private gain or loss of a business associate. Commissioners of community redevelopment agencies under Sec. 163.356 or 163.357, F.S., and officers of independent special tax districts elected on a one-acre, one-vote basis are not prohibited from voting in that capacity.

For purposes of this law, a "relative" includes only the officer's father, mother, son, daughter, husband, wife, brother, sister, father-in-law, mother-in-law, son-in-law, and daughter-in-law. A "business associate" means any person or entity engaged in or carrying on a business enterprise with the officer as a partner, joint venturer, coowner of property, or corporate shareholder (where the shares of the corporation are not listed on any national or regional stock exchange).

### ELECTED OFFICERS:

In addition to abstaining from voting in the situations described above, you must disclose the conflict:

×

\*

\*

\*

±

×

PRIOR TO THE VOTE BEING TAKEN by publicly stating to the assembly the nature of your interest in the measure on which you are abstaining from voting; and

WITHIN 15 DAYS AFTER THE VOTE OCCURS by completing and filing this form with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who should incorporate the form in the minutes.

### **APPOINTED OFFICERS:**

\*

\*

\*

Although you must abstain from voting in the situations described above, you otherwise may participate in these matters. However, you must disclose the nature of the conflict before making any attempt to influence the decision, whether orally or in writing and whether made by you or at your direction.

IF YOU INTEND TO MAKE ANY ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION PRIOR TO THE MEETING AT WHICH THE VOTE WILL BE TAKEN:

You must complete and file this form (before making any attempt to influence the decision) with the person responsible for recording the
minutes of the meeting, who will incorporate the form in the minutes. (Continued on other side)

APPOINTED OFFICERS (continu	led)		
A copy of the form must be provided immed	flately to the other members of the agency.		
The form must be read publicly at the next	meeting after the form is filed.		
IF YOU MAKE NO ATTEMPT TO INFLUENC	E THE DECISION EXCEPT BY DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING:		
You must disclose orally the nature of your	conflict in the measure before participating.		
<ul> <li>You must complete the form and file it with meeting, who must incorporate the form in agency, and the form must be read publicly</li> </ul>	in 15 days after the vote occurs with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the the minutes. A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the v at the next meeting after the form is filed.		
DISCLOSURE OF LOCAL OFFICER'S INTEREST			
I, Nestor Caballero	, hereby disclose that on <u>March 10</u> 20 <u>15</u>		
(a) A measure came or will come before my agency which (check one)			
inured to my special private gain or loss;			
inured to the special gain or loss of my business associate,;			
inured to the special gain or loss of my	relative,;		
inured to the special gain or loss of by			
whom I am retained; or			
inured to the special gain or loss of, which			
is the parent organization or subsidiary of a principal which has retained me.			
(b) The measure before my agency and the nature of my conflicting interest in the measure is as follows:			
Agenda item #7- My firm (Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP), serves as the independent external auditor for the ASPIRA Eugenia Maria de Hostos Charter School, ASPIRA South Youth Leadership Charter School and the ASPIRA Raul Arnaldo Martinez Charter School.			
3 / 10 / 17 Date Filed	Signature		

NOTICE: UNDER PROVISIONS OF FLORIDA STATUTES §112.317, A FAILURE TO MAKE ANY REQUIRED DISCLOSURE CONSTITUTES GROUNDS FOR AND MAY BE PUNISHED BY ONE OR MORE OF THE FOLLOWING: IMPEACHMENT, REMOVAL OR SUSPENSION FROM OFFICE OR EMPLOYMENT, DEMOTION, REDUCTION IN SALARY, REPRIMAND, OR A CIVIL PENALTY NOT TO EXCEED \$10,000.

FORM 8B MEMORANDUM OF VOTING CONFLICT FOR COUNTY, MUNICIPAL, AND OTHER LOCAL PUBLIC OFFICERS			
LAST NAME-FIRST NAME-MIDDLE NAME WENDELLON, EMUL K. MAILING ADDRESS SBOS SW 64 AVE	NAME OF BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY, OR COMMITTEE Audit & Brodget Aduisory Council to THE BOARD, COUNCIL, COMMISSION, AUTHORITY OR COMMITTEE ON WHICH I SERVE IS A UNIT OF: CITY COUNTY OTHER LOCAL AGENCY		
COUNTY MIAMÍ FL DATE ON WHICH VOTE OCCURRED 3/10/2015			

### WHO MUST FILE FORM 8B

This form is for use by any person serving at the county, city, or other local level of government on an appointed or elected board, council, commission, authority, or committee. It applies equally to members of advisory and non-advisory bodies who are presented with a voting conflict of interest under Section 112.3143, Florida Statutes.

Your responsibilities under the law when faced with voting on a measure in which you have a conflict of interest will vary greatly depending on whether you hold an elective or appointive position. For this reason, please pay close attention to the instructions on this form before completing the reverse side and filing the form.

### INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 112.3143, FLORIDA STATUTES

A person holding elective or appointive county, municipal, or other local public office MUST ABSTAIN from voting on a measure which inures to his or her special private gain or loss. Each elected or appointed local officer also is prohibited from knowingly voting on a measure which inures to the special gain or loss of a principal (other than a government agency) by whom he or she is retained (including the parent organization or subsidiary of a corporate principal by which he or she is retained); to the special private gain or loss of a business associate. Commissioners of community redevelopment agencies under Sec. 163.356 or 163.357, F.S., and officers of independent special tax districts elected on a one-acre, one-vote basis are not prohibited from voting in that capacity.

For purposes of this law, a "relative" includes only the officer's father, mother, son, daughter, husband, wife, brother, sister, father-in-law, mother-in-law, son-in-law, and daughter-in-law. A "business associate" means any person or entity engaged in or carrying on a business enterprise with the officer as a partner, joint venturer, coowner of property, or corporate shareholder (where the shares of the corporation are not listed on any national or regional stock exchange).

## ELECTED OFFICERS:

In addition to abstaining from voting in the situations described above, you must disclose the conflict:

PRIOR TO THE VOTE BEING TAKEN by publicly stating to the assembly the nature of your interest in the measure on which you are abstaining from voting; and

WITHIN 15 DAYS AFTER THE VOTE OCCURS by completing and filing this form with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who should incorporate the form in the minutes.

### **APPOINTED OFFICERS:**

\*

Although you must abstain from voting in the situations described above, you otherwise may participate in these matters. However, you must disclose the nature of the conflict before making any attempt to influence the decision, whether orally or in writing and whether made by you or at your direction.

IF YOU INTEND TO MAKE ANY ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION PRIOR TO THE MEETING AT WHICH THE VOTE WILL BE TAKEN:

You must complete and file this form (before making any attempt to influence the decision) with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who will incorporate the form in the minutes. (Continued on other side)

APPOINTED OFFICERS (continued) A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the agency. The form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed. IF YOU MAKE NO ATTEMPT TO INFLUENCE THE DECISION EXCEPT BY DISCUSSION AT THE MEETING: You must disclose orally the nature of your conflict in the measure before participating. You must complete the form and file it within 15 days after the vote occurs with the person responsible for recording the minutes of the meeting, who must incorporate the form in the minutes. A copy of the form must be provided immediately to the other members of the agency, and the form must be read publicly at the next meeting after the form is filed. DISCLOSURE OF LOCAL OFFICER'S INTEREST I, ENICK P. WENDERKON, hereby disclose that on 3 10 20 15 (a) A measure came or will come before my agency which (check one) inured to my special private gain or loss; inured to the special gain or loss of my business associate, \_\_\_\_\_; inured to the special gain or loss of my relative, \_\_\_\_\_ inured to the special gain or loss of whom I am retained; or inured to the special gain or loss of \_\_\_\_\_\_, which is the parent organization or subsidiary of a principal which has retained me. (b) The measure before my agency and the nature of my conflicting interest in the measure is as follows: My Children attend Somenset Acadomy South Mirami Gudler 3/10/15

NOTICE: UNDER PROVISIONS OF FLORIDA STATUTES §112.317, A FAILURE TO MAKE ANY REQUIRED DISCLOSURE CONSTITUTES GROUNDS FOR AND MAY BE PUNISHED BY ONE OR MORE OF THE FOLLOWING: IMPEACHMENT, REMOVAL OR SUSPENSION FROM OFFICE OR EMPLOYMENT, DEMOTION, REDUCTION IN SALARY, REPRIMAND, OR A CIVIL PENALTY NOT TO EXCEED \$10,000.

CE FORM 8B - EFF. 1/2000