The School Board Audit Committee (AC) met on Tuesday, December 7, 2010 at 12:30 p.m. in the School Board Administration Building, Conference Room 916, at 1450 N.E. Second Avenue, Miami, Florida.

**Members Present:**

**Voting:**
Mr. Frederick F. Thornburg, Esq., Chair  
Dr. Lawrence Feldman, School Board Vice Chair  
Ms. Susan Marie Kairalla  
Mr. Willie Kemp  
Ms. Wendy Lobos  
Mr. Mayowa Odusanya, Esq.  
Mr. Roland Sanchez-Medina, Esq.  
Mr. Jeffrey B. Shapiro, Esq.

**Members Absent:**
Mr. Peter A. Lagonowicz, Esq.

**Non-Voting:**  
(Absent) Dr. Richard H. Hinds, Associate Supt./CFO  
Mr. Jose F. Montes de Oca, CPA, Chief Auditor

**Call to Order**

The AC Chair called the meeting to order at 12:45 p.m. and warmly welcomed everyone in attendance.

**1. Introductions**

Mr. Thornburg asked everyone to introduce themselves. The following persons were present:

- Ms. Perla Tabares Hantman, School Board Chair
- Ms. Raquel Regalado, School Board Member
- Mr. Alberto M. Carvalho, Superintendent of Schools
- Mr. Walter J. Harvey, Esq., School Board Attorney
- Mr. Luis Garcia, Deputy Asst. School Board Attorney
- Mr. Freddie Woodson, Deputy Superintendent
- Dr. Helen Blanch, Assistant Superintendent
- Mr. Joseph A. Gomez, Assistant Superintendent
- Mr. Carl Nicoleau, Assistant Superintendent
- Ms. Maria Teresa Rojas, Assistant Superintendent
- Mr. Daniel Tosado, Assistant Superintendent
- Ms. Connie Pou, Controller
- Ms. Daisy Naya, Assistant Controller
- Dr. Marcos Moran, Assistant Superintendent
- Ms. Enid Weisman, Assistant Superintendent
- Ms. Maria T. Gonzalez, Asst. Chief, School Audits
- Mr. Julio C. Miranda, Asst. Chief, Investigative
- Ms. Silvia Rojas, Treasurer
- Mr. Trevor L. Williams, Asst. Chief, Operational Audits
- Ms. Deborah Karcher, Chief Information Officer
- Ms. Mariaelena Vidal, Emp. & Staffing Officer
- Ms. Mindy McNichols, Asst. School Board Attorney
Attendance Continued

Mr. John LaBonia, General Manager
Ms. Cynthia Gracia, Administrative Director
Mr. Jerry Klein, Administrative Director
Ms. Sherry Krubitch, Administrative Director
Ms. Marta Montaner, Administrative Director
Ms. Penny Parham, Administrative Director
Ms. Tiffanie Pauline, Administrative Director
Ms. Kim Gaines, District Director
Mr. Richard Lopez, District Director
Mr. Barry Meltz, District Director
Mr. Orlando Alonso, Director
Ms. Nicki Brisson, Director
Ms. Arlene Diaz, Director
Ms. Patricia Freeman, Director
Mr. Jon Goodman, Director
Ms. Chris Morgan, Director
Ms. Tamara Wain, Director
Mr. Dylan Hughes, Supervisor
Mr. Joseph Luzinski, Friends of WLRN
Mr. David Berley, Counsel
Office of the Auditor General
Mr. Ray Gonzalez, Supervisor
Mr. Gus Silva, Coordinator
Mr. Hector Quevedo, Senior
Advanced Learning Charter School
Mr. Carlos Gonzalez, Director
Mr. Gordon Crozier, Director
Archimedeans Academy
Mr. Dimitrios Bartsos, Board Chair
Mr. George Kaffoulis, Chief Exec.
Balere Language Academy
Ms. Rocka Malik, Director
Mr. Andre Prince, Consultant
Mr. Manuel Rodriguez, Treasurer
Mr. Galo Garcia, Board Member
Coral Reef Montessori Charter School
Ms. Juliet King, Co-Director
Ms. Lucy C. Golden, Co-Director
GLSC & CO
Mr. Ricardo Santos, Partner
Cecilia L. Love, Staff
Lincoln-Marti Mgmt. Svcs
Mr. Demetrio J. Perez
Miami Arts Charter School
Mr. Alfredo de la Rosa, Director
Ms. Christine de la Rosa, Co-Director
Mr. Gilbert Manresa, Board Chair
Mr. William Hunter, Consultant

Mr. Luis Baluja, Supervisor
Ms. Patra Liu, Asst. Inspector General
Ms. Dina Pearlman, Info Sys Design Control
Mr. Norberto Ferrada, Audit Supervisor
Mr. Michael Hernandez, Senior Audit Coordinator
Ms. Raveena Patel, Intern, Dr. Karp
Mr. Robert Schomber, Retired Audit Committee Member
Mrs. Jean Schomber, Visitor
Ms. Eileen Reilly, Supervisor
Ms. Bertha Valcarcel, Administrative Assistant
Mr. Jerold Blumstein, Administrative Assistant
Mr. Greg King, Administrative Assistant
Ms. Vivian Lissabet, Administrative Assistant
Ms. Lourdes Amaya, Administrative Secretary
Ms. Elsie Berrios-Montijo, Administrative Secretary
Ms. Sheryl Ragoo, Administrative Secretary
Ms. Cynthia Borders-Byrd, CBorders-Byrd, CPA LLC
Mr. Anthony Brunson, Sharpton
Mr. Rudy Larrimore, Sharpton
Mr. Ronald Frazier, BAC Organization
Mr. Michael Rosen, New Alternative Ed. H.S. of N. Dade
Mr. Dan Ricker, Reporter

Sandor Wiener
Ms. Vickie Burley, Coordinator
Mr. Henry Neyra, Accountant
Ms. Liliana Martorella, Director

Cuban American National Council, Inc.
Ms. Sonia Lopez, Exec. VP
Ms. Andres Pazos, Finance VP
Mr. Thornburg congratulated Ms. Perla Tabares Hantman on her recent election as Chair of the School Board of Miami-Dade County, Florida and also Dr. Feldman as Vice Chair of the School Board of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

In addition, Mr. Thornburg welcomed Ms. Raquel Regalado, Esq., a newly elected Board Member of the School Board of Miami-Dade County, Florida.

Thereafter, the A/C Chair recognized Mr. Robert Schomber, for his 34 years of valuable service to the Audit Committee and School District. He noted that Mr. Schomber had served as the A/C Chair on there different occasions during his record tenure on the A/C. Mr. Thornburg also recognized Mr. Schomber’s wife who for many years served as a volunteer and made valuable contributions to M-DCPS' Exceptional Students Education Programs. Chief Auditor, Mr. Jose F. Montes de Oca, presented a plaque on behalf of the A/C to Mr. Schomber as a token of its appreciation.

Mr. Schomber gave thanks to Dr. Karp, members of the Audit Committee, Superintendent and the Office of Management and Compliance Audits as well as the administration for their endeavors and concluded with the observation that it has been an interesting 34 years. He also expressed his view that the A/C has made great progress in its mission.

2. Approval of the Minutes of the Audit Committee meeting of September 14, 2010

Mr. Thornburg introduced the minutes for the AC meeting of September and asked whether any members had questions regarding the content of the minutes. There being no questions, a motion was duly made by Ms. Lobos and seconded by Dr. Feldman to approve the minutes on the official memorialization of the September 14, 2010 Committee meeting. The motion carried unanimously. Chair Thornburg commended Chief Auditor Jose Montes de Oca and his staff on a superb job on the AC minutes.

3. Oral Status Report on the Selection of Outside Auditors

Chief Auditor, Mr. Montes de Oca explained that pursuant to the directions of the AC at its September meeting and under the aegis of the procurement department’s published Request For Proposal (RFP) for External Auditing Services a total of five proposals had been received. At its special November 19, 2010 meeting the AC decided to extend invitations to four of the proposers to make presentations and to be interviewed at the Special Audit Committee meeting of January 13, 2011.

From this final group and predicated on the presentations and interviews, the A/C would conduct negotiations and would submit a recommendation to the School Board for engagement as the new external auditor. The RFP is made a part of these minutes by reference thereto.

Chief Auditor, Mr. Montes de Oca explained that pursuant to the directions of the AC at its September meeting and under the aegis of the procurement department’s published Request For Proposal (RFP) for External Auditing Services a total of five proposals had been received. At its special November 19, 2010 meeting the AC decided to extend invitations to
four of the proposers to make presentations and to be interviewed at the Special Audit Committee meeting of January 13, 2011.

EXTERNAL AUDITS:

4. (a) Presentation of 10 of the 82 Charter Schools and 3 Community Based Organizations Audited Financial Statements FYE June 30, 2010

Mr. Julio Miranda, Assistant Chief Auditor provided salient background information on certain charter schools that had financial issues of varying degrees of gravity. He explained that along with the financial statements, nine corrective action plans had been produced and submitted for the AC’s review. In his opinion, eight of the action plans appropriately addressed the conditions identified; however, he shared with the A/C that he harbored serious concerns with the issues related to Balere Academy and its financial viability. He also noted in detail violations of state nepotism laws at the Miami Arts Charter School.

Mr. Alfredo de la Rosa, Director, Miami Arts Charter School, addressed the concerns about nepotism at the school, explaining all the different avenues he explored to resolve this issue. According to Mr. De la Rosa the guidance he received including from, Mr. Adam Miller, Director, Florida Department of Education, is to the effect that the school is not in violation of any laws.

Mr. Thornburg deferred to Dr. Blanch to resolve this issue with Miami Arts Charter School, since Dr. Blanch continues to discuss this issue with the state and they have not come to an agreement.

Dr. Blanch informed the A/C that her office had not received independent confirmation of Mr. De la Rosa’s interaction with Mr. Miller.

Dr. Blanch will report back to the A/C on the ultimate resolution of these issues or if further input from the A/C was deemed necessary.

There was no further discussion and upon a motion duly made by Mr. Shapiro, seconded by Ms. Kairalla, that carried unanimously, it was recommended and approved that the Ten Charter Schools Meeting a Condition of Florida Statute 218.503 or Having Another Financial Issue be received and filed by the School Board.

4. (b) Presentation of 3 Community Based Organizations

Mr. Thornburg noted that an improvement plan for the Cuban American National Council, Inc., requested by the Committee pursuant to the review of the Council’s financial statements at the September 14, 2010 meeting, indicates that the organization has made substantial fiscal improvement. The report for AMIkids Miami-Dade, Inc. (formerly Dade
Marine Institute) shows an improvement in its operating loss while Richmond-Perrine Optimist Club, Inc., report reflects a modest surplus.

There being no further discussion, a motion was made by Mr. Odusanya, seconded by Mr. Sanchez-Medina, and carried unanimously, to recommend that the AMIkids Miami-Dade, Inc. (formerly Dade Marine Institute), Richmond-Perrine Optimist Club, Inc., Cuban American National Council, Inc. Community Based Organization reports be received and filed by the School Board.


Mr. Raymond Gonzalez, Audit Supervisor, Miami Office for the State of Florida Auditor General, introduced the report and focused the A/C on the positive fact that the CAFR received an unqualified opinion and had no adverse findings. In addition, he recognized, Dr. Hinds, Ms. Connie Pou and their staffs for their outstanding work and the level of cooperation provided. He also recognized Mr. Montes de Oca and his staff for assisting with the process of meeting their deadlines.

There was no further discussion and upon a motion duly made by Mr. Shapiro, seconded by Mr. Sanchez-Medina, that carried unanimously, it was recommended and approved that the Comprehensive Annual Financial Report for Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2010 be received and filed by the School Board.


Ms. Borders-Byrd presented her report to the Audit Committee noting that the financial statements for fiscal year ended June 30, 2010 present fairly, in all material respects the financial position of the Educational Facilities Impact Fee Fund. She also observed that the report contains an unqualified opinion and there were no audit findings.

Accordingly, and upon a motion duly made by Mr. Shapiro, seconded by Mr. Sanchez-Medina, that carried unanimously, it was recommended and approved that the Annual Financial Statements, Educational Impact Fee Fund for Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2010 be received and filed by the School Board.
The following agenda items were presented together:

7. Audit of the WLRN Television and Radio Stations for Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2010
8. Audit of the Magnet Education Choice Association Inc. (MECA) for Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2010
10. Audit of the Miami-Dade Coalition Community Education, Inc. for Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2010

Mr. Anthony Brunson, Partner, Sharpton, Brunson & Company, P.A. made a presentation on the audited financial statements of WLRN Television and Radio Stations. Mr. Brunson reported that the financial statements present fairly in all material respects the financial position of the stations and no material findings were reported. He noted that total revenues for the television and radio stations, were $8.9 million and $7.7 million, respectively, and that grants received from the Corporation for Public Broadcasting totaled $1.9 million for the past fiscal year.

Mr. Montes de Oca asked the auditors to elaborate on notes 10 and 11 to the financial statements of the TV and radio stations, respectively. Specifically, he wanted the A/C to be cognizant of how much of the revenue collected by Friends from the Clearwire Spectrum Broadband Frequency lease had been remitted to WLRN and how much remains in the custody of Friends.

Mr. Brunson responded that these amounts were not within the scope of his audit; however, he would attempt to obtain the requested information. To date, Friends has failed to adequately respond to the Chief Auditor’s inquiry.

The discussion on this report was combined with another agenda item that called for a status report on the progress being made on an Operating Agreement between WLRN and Friends of WLRN (Friends) including the status of the amendment of the current Friends’ by-laws to bring them into concert with the governing by-laws in effect in 1995. At a previous Audit Committee meeting, the Committee Chair noted the Superintendent and the Committee were advised that the Friends’ by-laws had been so amended but to date written evidence of such by-law amendments and changes have not been produced as promised.

Lengthy discussions ensued over the high level of concern regarding the evident lack of progress being made by WLRN and Friends with regard to negotiating and finalizing an Operating Agreement. This Operating Agreement undertaking has been on-going for almost one year.
For the benefit of the new A/C members and to refresh recollections on the subject, Mr. Thornburg explained, by way of background, that the Superintendent had requested the Audit Committee in January 2010 to delve into and assist the administration in analyzing the various relationship problems and issues which have accrued over time between WLRN and Friends. During the December 7, 2010 meeting, the Superintendent and the Audit Committee Chair provided a detailed and thorough history and analysis of the events which have given rise to these disagreements and an appraisal of the current status of this situation and the request of the A/C as endorsed by the Superintendent to have the parties negotiate and finalize an Operating Agreement.

Thereafter, the members of the School Board and Audit Committee in attendance at the meeting registered their strong concerns and dissatisfaction with the lack of progress being made in the development of the proposed Operating Agreement. Though not an exhaustive list, these concerns and observations of dissatisfaction and registered concerns included the following:

1. Contrary to what the Superintendent and the Audit Committee were previously told and as expressed and agreed to in the four-point agreement reached by WLRN and Friends, there is no evidence that the Friends’ by-laws have been amended to bring them in line with the provisions of the Friends’ 1995 by-laws thereby restoring the Superintendent’s rights;
2. School Board Chair Ms Perla Tabares Hantman’s recommendations for revisions to the Friends’ by-laws have not been addressed and have been ignored;
3. the concern over how much of the reportedly $6 million received by Friends from the Clearwire Spectrum Lease continues to be retained by Friends and not remitted to WLRN. This concern is compounded by the knowledge that Friends’ mission is to raise funds for WLRN and by the fact that a very challenging and difficult economic environment exists for the School System and WLRN;
4. failure to yet address critical issues relating to Friends’ proposal to establish an endowment fund;
5. Friends’ past expenditures of monies to find a station acquisition; this was done without the knowledge and consent of WLRN, the School District administration or the School Board (the license holder);
6. because of the deletion of the Superintendent’s rights and authority, as provided for under the 1995 by-laws, without requisite notification or following the requirements for by-law amendments, concern was expressed over the issue of whether possibly all actions taken since that time could be null and void including the substantial salaries and benefits that were approved during this period;
7. Friends has been dilatory, disrespectful and ignored requests; and
8. Friends asserts that good progress is being made on negotiating the operating agreement while WLRN’s General Manager, Mr. John LaBonia strongly disagreed with Friend’s assessment.

Thereafter, School Board Vice-Chair and Audit Committee member, Dr. Lawrence Feldman, opined that he deemed it unacceptable that Friends should be sitting on WLRN’s money and has failed to address the School Board Chair’s suggested by-law
changes. He also stated the School District has cut its budget significantly while Friends has not.

Dr. Feldman supported the view that the School District should consider the institution of appropriate legal action if Friends continues to engage in dilatory conduct, fails to abide by the four-point agreement and fails to resolve all other outstanding issues including the endowment. He also sought the support of the Audit Committee on this endeavor.

School Board Chair Hantman raised the well-taken rhetorical question of why should anybody be surprised by the conduct of Friends and why should caution be exercised in light of the fact that Friends has totally disregarded what the Superintendent and the Audit Committee have said and ignored the by-laws changes that she proposed, as endorsed by the Audit Committee.

Accordingly, Dr. Feldman made a motion, which was unanimously approved, that the School Board Attorney be prepared at the February Audit Committee meeting to provide an analysis and assessment of all legal issues in order to enable this matter to move forward with legal action if all these issues are not resolved.

The Committee reviewed the certified financial statements for three Direct Support Organizations, the Magnet Education Choice Association, Inc. (MECA), The Dade Schools Athletic Foundation, Inc., and the Miami-Dade Coalition Community Education, Inc. and approved them as they contained no adverse audit findings.

There was no further discussion. A motion was made by Mr. Sanchez-Medina, seconded by Mr. Odusanya, that carried unanimously, to recommend that the Audits of WLRN Television and Radio Stations, Magnet Education Choice Association, Inc. (MECA), Dade Schools Athletic Foundation, Inc., Miami-Dade Coalition Community Education, Inc. for Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2010 be received and filed by the School Board

INTERNAL AUDITS:


Chief Auditor, Montes de Oca also apprised the A/C of a fraud investigation case that Mr. Julio Miranda oversaw and noted that as a result $198,000 dollars may be recovered for the M-DCPS. He also noted that more details will be provided as other issues related to this case become public information.
12. Internal Audit Report – Selected Schools

Ms. Maria T. Gonzalez, Assistant Chief Auditor, presented the Selected Schools Audit and pointed out that it includes the results of 79 audits, eleven of which had audit exceptions. She also informed the A/C that there were investigations at three schools where Mr. Miranda and her department worked collaboratively.

There was lengthy discussion by several audit committee and board members concerning follow up procedures where an audit reveals material problems. They inquired whether follow ups should be conducted in less than a year if an issue or problem is serious and material in nature.

Mr. Montes de Oca explained that although auditing resources are limited, the vast majority of school audits are conducted annually and those schools with serious findings are targeted for annual audits. He observed that schools need to be given sufficient time to correct any problems.

Mr. Thornburg pointed out that the comments made regarding the follow ups were not targeting schools but the overall.

Mr. Woodson explained that depending on the severity of the situation and where deemed warranted, disciplinary action is taken with no hesitation.

Chair Thornburg commended Ms. Gonzalez for the great job she does in conducting and reporting on school audits.

There was no further discussion and upon a motion duly made by Mr. Shapiro, seconded by Mr. Sanchez-Medina, that carried unanimously, it was recommended and approved that the Internal Audit Report – Selected Schools be received and filed by the School Board.

13. Audit of Administrative Offices Network and Information Security Audit Human Resources

Mr. Williams introduced the report and provided a brief history of how this audit came about. He explained that IT Audits was a component of the School Audits. Presently, IT Audits are conducted through the District-level so that the focus will be on the offices and departments. He further explained that a self assessment survey was dispensed to administrative offices to allow them time to address any issues that the offices might find. Mr. Williams pointed out that most of the issues found in HR will surface in other offices as well. He also noted that HR was responsive in addressing a lot of the issues, especially the matters that he felt were serious enough.
School Board member Ms. Regalado inquired on why our server system is not in riveted with the Cloud. She expressed that our system is a bit antiquated and if it has been ever considered to have our system in the cloud.

Ms. Karcher explained that the cloud is basically done on a case by case basis, but she will look into it.

Mr. Thornburg asked Ms. Karcher if she would prepare an e-mail on the approach taken with respect to the Cloud and forward to School Board and the A/C members.

There was no further discussion and upon a motion duly made by Mr. Odusanya, seconded by Mr. Shapiro, that carried unanimously, it was recommended and approved that the Internal Audit Report – Administrative Offices Network and Information Security Audit Human Resources be received and filed by the School Board.

14. Audit of Year-End Inventories as of June 30, 2010

Mr. Williams explained that all inventories were satisfactory, except for some continued unexplained variances at the Transportation Department. Such variances were not material or significant.

The District administration addressed questions posed by some Committee members. The A/C members expressed satisfaction with the report.

There was no further discussion and upon a motion duly made by Mr. Shapiro, seconded by Mr. Sanchez-Medina, that carried unanimously, it was recommended and approved that the Internal Audit Report – Year-End Inventories as of June 30, 2010 be received and filed by the School Board.

OTHER BUSINESS:

15. Second Annual Report for the M-DCPS OIG Office Fiscal Year 2009-2010

Ms. Patra Liu presented the Second Annual Report for the M-DCPS OIG Office. Ms. Liu highlighted several sections of the report noting that the Interlocal Agreement (ILA) is located at the end of the report and reported that the ILA has been extended until 2013. She also referred to page 9 which canvasses the results from earlier IG investigations.

Since this report was for informational purposes only, transmittal to the School Board by the AC was not required.
16. OIG Final Report Re: Manipulation of the McKay Scholarship Program Process by M-DCPS Employees

This report was presented for informational purposes only and discussion on the report was limited because of on-going personnel issues.

Chief Auditor Montes de Oca pointed out that the reason he presented the report was due to the governing board rule and the ILA which require such reports to be presented to the Audit Committee.

Since this report was for informational purposes only, no transmittal to the School Board by the AC was required.

17. Status Report of the WLRN Operating Agreement

This item was previously addressed in conjunction with Item #7.

This report was for informational purposes only and accordingly no transmittal to the School Board by the AC was required.


Mr. Thornburg explained that Mr. Clark’s memorandum of September 7, 2010 serves as an update regarding the discussion which occurred at the Audit Committee Meeting of January 26, 2010 and a detailed presentation which was made at the March, 2010 Audit Committee meeting regarding re-marketing strategies for Risk and Management services.

Mr. Thornburg complimented Mr. Clark on his analysis and the creativity of his recommendation.

Mr. Clark recommended that on an annual basis staff from the Office of Risk and Benefits Management provide the School Board and the Audit Committee the status of re-marketing and renewal strategies for insurance and risk management programs.

There was no further discussion and upon a motion duly made by Mr. Sanchez-Medina, seconded by Mr. Shapiro, that carried unanimously, it was recommended and approved that the Follow-Up to Discussion at Audit Committee Regarding Re-Marketing Strategies be forwarded to the School Board.
19. Minority/Women Business Enterprise (M/WBE) Update

Mr. Thornburg summarized salient background information regarding the M/WBE update. Ms. Freeman noted that she has the requested comparison of M/WBE results with other large school districts and what steps if any, other districts may have undertaken to materially encourage female and minority enterprise participation in contract awards.

The Committee agreed to hold an Ad-Hoc Committee meeting in January 2011 to receive the requested report on M-DCPS’ M/WBE program comparison with other large school districts. Committee member, Ms. Susan Kairalla was appointed by Mr. Thornburg as Chair of the Ad-Hoc Committee.

There was no further discussion and upon a motion duly made by Mr. Shapiro, seconded by Ms. Kairalla, that carried unanimously, that the Audit Committee with the endorsement of the School Board members in attendance asked that a letter be sent to Mr. Renier Diaz de la Portilla requesting that the reporting date of February 2011 as provided for in Item H-17 be extended to April, 2011 in order to afford the Audit Committee Ad-Hoc Committee sufficient time to submit its report and the Audit Committee to act upon it, at its March 8, 2011 meeting.

Adjournment

There being no further business to come before the Committee and after extending his very best wish to everyone for the Holiday Season and New Year and thanking those in attendance for their attendance, interest and participation, Mr. Thornburg adjourned the meeting at 3:39 p.m. upon motion duly made and seconded.